

**Alerting Students to the Correct Use of *Until*
Using an Algorithmic Approach**

Alice Y. W. Chan
City University of Hong Kong

Alice Y. W. Chan is an assistant professor in the Department of English and Communication, City University of Hong Kong. Her areas of interest include phonetics and phonology, lexicography, contrastive analysis, syntax, and error correction.

An Algorithmic Approach to Error Correction

Handling students' language accuracy problems is one of the main difficulties facing English as a Second Language (ESL) teachers nowadays. To help students overcome their persistent common lexico-grammatical problems, my collaborators and I have recently developed an algorithmic approach to error correction (Chan, 2002; Chan, Kwan, & Li, 2002a, 2002b, in press; Chan & Li, 2002; Chan, Li, & Kwan, in press; Kwan, Chan, & Li, in press; Li & Chan, 2000, 2001). Partly inspired by theoretical and empirical studies in consciousness-raising research (Rutherford, 1987, 1988; Schmidt, 1990; Sharwood Smith, 1981), and partly by recent research into form-focused instruction (Doughty & Williams, 1998), the algorithmic approach is characterized by four main features: (a) pedagogically sound input requiring minimal cognitive effort; (b) proceduralized steps supported by instructive examples; (c) explicit rules to help learners conceptualize the correction procedure; and (d) reinforcement exercises.

We experimented with 13 lexico-grammatical problems, such as the dangling modifier, the inappropriate use of the connective *on the contrary*, and the anomalous structure *very like*, as in the sentence *I very like music* (for details, see Li, Chan, & Kwan, 2002). Results of the research study show that the approach is effective and versatile, and that students made significant improvements in the lexico-grammatical items under investigation after remedial teaching (Chan, 2002; Chan, Kwan, & Li, 2002a; Chan & Li, 2002).

Teachers may apply the algorithmic approach to other anomalies, provided they are well-defined lexico-grammatical problems amenable to effective correction using the approach (Chan, 2002). To show the versatility and adaptability of the algorithmic approach, I will describe its main features using the teaching procedure for a lexico-grammatical problem not dealt with in the research study—the use of the lexical item *until*, which is used inappropriately by many Chinese ESL students, including advanced learners.

Use of *Until*

The following examples show how *until* is inappropriately used.

1. ?The most important person in my life is my father *until forever*.
2. ?I still remember this picture *until now*.
3. ?I have not heard from, you *until present*.

At first glance, the sentences all seem acceptable. A careful scrutiny of the intended meanings, however, reveals that by using *until* with words like *forever* or *now*, the speaker wants to emphasize the truth of the preceding statement both at the time of speaking and *forever* or *now*. The speaker does not intend to state that the preceding statement ceases to be true *forever* or *now*. Such a use of *until* may result in misunderstanding between the speaker and the listener.

To help students acquire the target language norm, teachers should guide them to understanding the proper use of the lexical item. According to the *Collins COBUILD English Dictionary for Advanced Learners* (2001), if something happens *until* a particular time, it happens during the period before that time and stops at that time. The preposition *until* is also used with a negative to emphasize the moment in time after which the rest of the statement becomes true, or the condition that would make it true (p. 1720; also see Quirk, Greenbaum, Leech, & Svartvik, 1985, p. 534). The following section demonstrates how teachers can help students discover the correct use of *until*.

Procedure

Phase I: Help Students Notice the Problem

Are the following sentences correct? Mark a **I** if you think so, and a **x** if you don't think so. Two examples have been done for you.

X

a. She will wait until 4 p.m.	
b. The most important person in my life is my father until forever.	
c. He will not stop working until he is tired.	
d. I have not eaten my lunch until now.	
e. She was a high-ranking official in the committee until 2003.	
f. I remember his name until now.	

Phase II: Guide Students to Discover the Correct Use of Until

Although the sentences all look similar, some of them may not be used appropriately to express the writers' views. Let us look at sentence (a) first.

(a) She will wait until 4 p.m.

Ⓡ What will she do? _____

Ⓡ Is she going to wait nonstop? _____

* When will she stop waiting? _____

Now, let us look at sentence (b).

(b) The most important person in my life is my father until forever.

- Who is the most important person in my life? _____
- Is my father the most important person in my life FOREVER?

Let us compare sentence (a) with sentence (b). Fill in the boxes below by putting a or a x to show the truth of the statements (in capitals) at the time specified.

(a) WAIT	Before 4 p.m.	4 p.m. and after

The above shows that although both sentence (a) and sentence (b) use *until* with a time, the intended meanings are different.

Now, let us look at sentence (c).

(c) He will not stop working until he is tired.

- What will he NOT do? _____
- Is he going to work nonstop? _____
- When will he stop? _____

Look at sentence (d).

(d) I have not eaten my lunch until now.

- Did I have my lunch before saying the sentence? _____
- Did I have my lunch when saying the sentence? _____

Let us compare sentence (c) with sentence (d). Fill in the boxes below by putting a or a x to show the truth of the statements (in capitals) at the time specified.

(c) STOPS WORKING	Before <i>he is tired</i>	When <i>he is tired</i> and after

(d) EATEN MY LUNCH	Before <i>now</i>	<i>Now</i> and after

Again, the above shows that although both sentence (c) and sentence (d) use *until* with a time, the intended meanings are different.

Phase III: Introduce Explicit Rules for the Use of Until

REMEMBER:

If something happens *UNTIL* a particular time, it happens during the period before that time and stops at that time.

Example: I work until 5 p.m.

5 p.m.

WORK? 1_
✓ X

We use *UNTIL* with a negative to emphasize the moment in time after which the rest of our statement becomes true.

Example: The law will NOT take effect until the end of the year.

..... end of year

LAW TAKES EFFECT? 1_
X ✓

Now, use the rules above to help you determine the appropriateness of sentences (e) and (f).

Phase IV: Give Reinforcement Exercises

1. Write a sentence using *until* to express the meanings conveyed by the following pairs of sentences.

Example: She waited. She did not wait after 4 p.m.
 She waited *until* 4 p.m.

- a. Don't leave now. Leave when I come.
- b. Stay here. Don't stay here when the rain stops.
- c. I didn't realize she was American. When she spoke, I realized that.
- d. They slept. They woke up when the alarm clock rang.
- e. She was happy. She was not happy when her mother died.

2. Read the following dialogues and judge whether or not the underlined sentences are used appropriately. For each underlined sentence, if you think it is appropriate, put a ✓ at the end of it; if you think it is inappropriate, put a x and suggest an appropriate correction.

a. A: Did you receive my letter? I haven't received a reply from you until now.

B: Oh, yes. I received your letter, but I didn't have time to write back to you. I'm sorry.

b. A: It's very late now; I think you need to go to bed.

B: No, I can't. The work is very urgent. I won't stop until I finish.

A: All right. Then go to bed immediately when you have finished it.

c. A: Do you remember the picture that John drew?

B: Of course. Although I have just seen it once, I remember it until present. It's fantastic!

Conclusion

The inappropriate use of *until is* a persistent common error made by many ESL learners, including tertiary students. In this article, I have shown how the use of proceduralized steps, instructive examples,

and explicit rules can help students conceptualize the correct model. The algorithmic approach described in this article, which adopts a step-by-step consciousness-raising mechanism, helps to arouse learners' consciousness of the nature of the anomaly and the correct usage. When learners can notice their own errors and have a heightened awareness of the target language norm, they will be able to achieve mature linguistic competence. I suggest that ESL teachers try adopting this approach to help their students overcome other common, consistent lexico-grammatical problems their students encounter.

REFERENCES

- Chan, A. Y. W. (2002, December). *An algorithmic approach to error correction: An empirical study*. Paper presented at the Seventh Conference on English in Southeast Asia, Hong Kong.
- Chan, A. Y. W., Kwan, B. S. C., & Li, D. C. S. (2002a). An algorithmic approach to error correction: Correcting three common errors at different levels. *JALT Journal*, 24, 201-216.
- Chan, A. Y. W., Kwan, B. S. C., & Li, D. C. S. (2002b). Helping students overcome the *somewhere has something* problem. *Guidelines*, 24(1), 14-18.
- Chan, A. Y. W., Kwan, B. S. C., & Li, D. C. S. (in press). Tackling the 'independent clause as subject' problem. *Asian Journal of English Language Teaching*.
- Chan, A. Y. W., & Li, D. C. S. (2002). Form-focused remedial instruction: An empirical study. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 12, 24-53.
- Chan, A. Y. W., Li, D. C. S., & Kwan, B. S. C. (in press). Misplacement and misuse of *very*: Helping students overcome the *very + VERB* problem. *The English Teacher: An International Journal*.
- Collins COBUILD English dictionary for advanced learners* (major new ed.). (2001). Glasgow: HarperCollins.

- Doughty, C., & Williams, J. (Eds.). (1998). *Focus on form in classroom second language acquisition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kwan, B. S. C., Chan, A. Y. W., & Li, D. C. S. (in press). 'According to X, X said...': A consciousness-raising approach to helping Cantonese speakers overcome problems in topic-comment structures. *Asia Pacific Journal of Language in Education*.
- Li, D. C. S., & Chan, A. Y. W. (2000). Form-focused negative feedback: Toward a pedagogically sound model of remedial instruction. In D. C. S. Li, A. Lin, & W. K. Tsang (Eds.), *Language and education in postcolonial Hong Kong* (pp. 333-351). Hong Kong: Linguistic Society of Hong Kong.
- Li, D. C. S., & Chan, A. Y. W. (2001). Form-focused negative feedback: Correcting three common errors. *TESL Reporter*, 34(1), 22-34.
- Li, D. C. S., Chan, A. Y. W., & Kwan, B. C. S. (2002). *Consciousness-raising approach to error correction in the ESL classroom*. Retrieved May 30, 2003, from <http://penonal.cityu.edu.hk/encrpmj>
- Quirk, R., Greenbaum, S., Leech, G., & Svartvik, J. (1985). *A comprehensive grammar of the English language*. London: Longman.
- Rutherford, W. (1987). *Second language grammar: Learning and teaching*. New York: Longman.
- Rutherford, W. (1988). Consciousness raising and universal grammar. In W. Rutherford & M. Sharwood Smith (Eds.), *Grammar and second language teaching: A book of readings* (pp. 107-116). New York: Newbury House.
- Schmidt, R. (1990). The role of consciousness in second language learning. *Applied Linguistics*, 11, 129-158.

Sharwood Smith, M. (1981). Consciousness-raising and the second language learner. *Applied Linguistics*, 2, 159-169.

BOOK REVIEWS

The ESL Student's Secret Weapon

Yuki Kauai

Portland State University

The Cambridge Dictionary of American English. Sidney I. Landau (Ed.). Cambridge, UK; New York: Cambridge University Press. Pp. 1088. 2000. \$23.00. ISBN: 0-521-77974-X paperback with CD-ROM.

Yuki Kanai is a graduate student in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages who studies in the Applied Linguistics department of Portland State University
